NATIVE
AND NATIONAL
IN BRAZIL
This page intentionally left blank
NATIVE AND NATIONAL IN BRAZIL

Indigeneity after Independence

Tracy Devine Guzmán

First Peoples
New Directions in Indigenous Studies

The University of North Carolina Press
Chapel Hill
Native and national in Brazil: indigeneity after independence / Tracy Devine Guzmán.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Devine Guzmán, Tracy, 1970–
Native and national in Brazil : indigeneity after independence / Tracy Devine Guzmán.

Includes bibliographical references and index.
isbn 978-1-4696-0208-0 (cloth : alk. paper) —
isbn 978-1-4696-0209-7 (pbk. : alk. paper)
1. Indians of South America—Brazil—Ethnic identity.  2. Indians of South America—Brazil—Politics and government.  3. Indians of South America—Brazil—Public opinion.  4. Indians in popular culture.  5. Public opinion—Brazil.  6. Brazil—Ethnic relations.  7. Brazil—Politics and government.  I. Title.
f2519.3.e83d48 2013
305.800981—dc23  2012045725

 Portions of this work were previously published in different form as
“Diacuí Killed Iracema: Indigenism, Nationalism and the Struggle for Brazilianness,”
Bulletin of Latin American Research 24, no. 1 (2005), and “Our Indians in Our America: Anti-Imperialist Imperialism and the Construction of Brazilian Modernity,”
Latin American Research Review 45, no. 3 (2010).
For Marina and Siena

If you count
all the letters in
all the words on
all the pages in
all the books that
have been or ever will be written,
I love you more than that.
CONTENTS

Acknowledgments, xi
Abbreviations, xix

INTRODUCTION / Indians without Indigeneity, 1
*The Colonialist Renderings of the Present*

1 / From Acculturation to Interculturality, 31
*Paradigms for Including through Exclusion*

2 / On Cannibals and Christians, 63
*The Violent Displacements of Nation Building*

3 / Anti-Imperialist Imperialism and Other Constructions of Modernity, 105

4 / Unraveling Indianist Hegemony and the Myth of the Brazilian Race, 131

5 / A Native Critique of Sovereignty, 159
*The Brazilian Indigenous Movement in the New Millennium*

EPilogue / Postindigenism, 195

APPENDIX / Final Document of the Conference of Indigenous Peoples and Organizations of Brazil, 207

Notes, 211
Bibliography, 263
Index, 301
This page intentionally left blank
ILLUSTRATIONS

Map of Brazil, xxii
Maria da Graça Meneghel (Xuxa), Rio de Janeiro, February 1989, 5
Oscar Pereira da Silva, *Desembarque de Pedro Álvares Cabral em Porto Seguro*, 1500, 1922, 12
Federal Deputy Mário Juruna, the first indigenous Brazilian elected to the National Congress, Brasília, 1984, 18
List of Brazilian names given to indigenous students on the Laranjinha SPI Post (Paraná), 1 December 1942, 33
Raimundo Roberto Kapêlituk, *Bandeira do Brasil [Brazilian Flag]*, 1948, 34
Frontispiece of the copy of *Il guarany* given to Dom Pedro II by Antônio Carlos Gomes, 1870, 64
“The Man and His Art: Ornamental Motif of the Extinct Indians of Marajó Island,” 66
Dedication page of the copy of *Il guarany* gifted to the emperor in 1870, 71
Original score from Carlos Gomes’s Italian-born daughter, Ítala Gomes Vas (sic) de Carvalho, no date, 73
The newspapers *Cabichuí* (13 May 1867) and *Cacique Lambaré* (24 July 1867) racialized Paraguay’s struggle against Brazil during the War of the Triple Alliance, 75
Brazil as “Indian,” leeched by the Senate and the Câmara, and bled by the Barão de Cotegipe, 80
Rondon Commission’s registration of Terena men, no date, 86
Pedro Américo, *Batalha do Avaí*, 1872/1877, 88
The baritone de Anna, the first Ibarê, 92
Captured Kaingang children, circa 1912, 103
Entry for the “Former International Reserve of Amazon Forest” in the bogus textbook, *An Introduction to Geography*, 106
“They want to ‘eat’ our forests!,” 107
Cover of the Sivamzinho Educational Notebook, 113
Map of SPI Indigenous Posts nationwide, 1930, 115
Flag-raising ceremony with Terena students from Mato Grosso, 1942, 118
Karajá community registered by the Rondon Commission, circa 1910, 120
SPI classroom on the Rodolfo Miranda Indigenous Post in Amazonas, circa 1922, 121
“The Kalapalo Bride [Diacuí Canualo Aiute] in her gorgeous white dress”, 141
“Symbol of the National Communion: The wedding, in Rio, of the little Kalapalo Indian to the white sertanista”, 146
José Maria de Medeiros, *Iracema*, 1884, 151
“Indians” and Brazil’s quincentennial celebration of April 2000, 155
“Former Krenak Indian” with SPI director Modesto Donatini Dias da Cruz, 1946, 186
New and improved “civilized” housing on an SPI indigenous post in Mato Grosso, no date, 186
The city of Altamira (Pará) “before and after” the anticipated construction of the Belo Monte hydroelectric dam, 188
Edition of the *Turma da Mônica* comic series created by artist Maurício de Sousa in the early 1970s, 198
INBRAP logotype representing the power of indigenous knowledge to influence Occidental knowledge and dominant society, 201
Founder of the Movimento Indígenas em Ação, Ysani Kalapalo leads a demonstration against the Belo Monte hydroelectric dam in downtown São Paulo, 20 August 2011, 204
Demonstration against the Belo Monte hydroelectric dam in downtown São Paulo, 20 August 2011, 204
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The stories behind the stories that I share in this book begin and end with serendipity and with love. As a graduate student in the late 1990s, having spent many months mired in education documents in the archive of the Serviço de Proteção aos Índios (Indian Protection Service, or SPI), I happened upon an image of a young woman in an unusual-looking wedding gown and stumbled, unwittingly, into a labyrinth of forbidden romance, political intrigue, and devastating loss. As I would come to learn, the events that culminated in that image had once been known as “the case of Diacuí,” named for the Kalapalo teenager whose controversial “interracial” marriage in 1952 sparked a heated national debate about the relationship between indigenous peoples and Brazil, both as a place and an idea. I soon discovered the ultimate tragedy of her story, but it would take several years for me to grasp the magnitude of that tragedy, and longer still to piece together what it meant then, what came before it, and why it matters today.

In the end, this book is not really about Diacuí Canualo Aiute, but her life remains at its center in many ways. And so, my first words of gratitude must go to her, to her family, to the Kalapalo people, and to the indigenous peoples of Xingu and Brazil, whose struggles for freedom and justice endure today in the face of tremendous and growing odds. I especially wish to thank Ysani Kalapalo, who took time to speak with me about the legacy of her great aunt in August 2011, while we were both participating in the massive, peaceful demonstration that she helped organize to protest the construction of the Belo Monte hydroelectric dam in the state of Pará, now under way. Not much older than her aunt at the time of her untimely passing, Ysani, alongside many collaborators, continues to challenge received knowledge about indigeneity and Brazilianness, among other things. Ever inspired by their tireless labor, I count myself fortunate to have learned so much from them.

Many other people have guided me in my research, thinking, and writing about the questions explored in this work, and it is a privilege to recognize my tremendous debt to them here. I would like to express my deep appreciation to the scholars, writers, and activists whose ideas and lives I
engage in these pages. A bibliography is, in some regard, the most important and sincere form of acknowledgment, for without it, there would be no meaningful discussion and no book. I am especially beholden to Eliane Potiguara, Daniel Munduruku, Lúcio Paiva Flores, and Florêncio Almeida Vaz, whose varied work in indigenous cultural production and digital scholarship has been key to my thinking about indigeneity and politics in modern-day Brazil, and thus crucial to the entire project. I am likewise obliged to Paulo Baltazar, Olívio Jekupé, Juvenal Payayá, and Marcos Terena for helping with invaluable information along the way.

I am greatly appreciative of the funding that has made research possible at different stages and would like to acknowledge the support of the Ford Foundation, the Mellon Foundation, the Tinker Foundation, numerous Foreign Language and Area Studies fellowships, and several grants and fellowships from Duke University, the University of North Carolina at Charlotte, and the University of Miami. In June and July 2010, I participated in a National Endowment for the Humanities (NEH) seminar at Newberry Library’s D’Arcy McNickle Center for American Indian and Indigenous Studies that was crucial to the project’s conclusion. My thanks to the NEH; to my fellow participants, for their sharing their ideas; to the Newberry staff, for their generous help in acquiring and copying materials; to John Powell, for his assistance in securing permissions; and especially to the center’s director, Scott Manning Stevens, who led the seminar with relentless brilliance and good cheer.

Research in Brazil has taken me from Bahia, Brasília, Pernambuco, and Mato Grosso do Sul, to Minas Gerais, Pará, Rio de Janeiro, and São Paulo, and I am thankful for the support that I received in each of those places from archivists, librarians, colleagues, and friends. The Programa de Pós-Graduação em Antropologia Social at the Museu Nacional, and the SPI/FUNAI archives at the Museu do Índio provided me with crucial institutional backing and an intellectual home during the years I lived in Rio, and I am grateful to the people there who helped in so many ways. I wish to thank particularly Antonio Carlos de Souza Lima for facilitating my affiliation with the Museu Nacional, for allowing me to participate in his seminar on indigenist thought and practice in Latin America, and for offering helpful feedback on the earliest version of the project. I thank him, not least, for his groundbreaking scholarship, which has long been a cornerstone of my work. Carlos Agosto da Rocha Freire, whom I also first met at the Museu Nacional, shared valuable insights from his research regarding the history of Brazil’s labyrinthine indigenous bureaucracies and generously helped decipher unlabeled images from the
Comissão Rondon. Bruna Franchetto invited me to discuss my work with her doctoral seminar on bilingual and intercultural education, where I also received helpful feedback and advice.

My beloved comadre, Rosely Rondinelli, led the textual archive of the Museu do Índio with generosity and contagious joy during the years that I did the bulk of my research there, and I can never thank her enough for her warm encouragement and many hours of engaging conversation. I am obliged to Denise Portugal and Renata Vaz, both from the audio-visual archive of the Museu do Índio, for their assistance with several of the images that appear the book, and to André Pimentel Mendes of Sagres Filmes for his help tracking down video materials. Many thanks to the staff at the Museu Emílio Goeldi in Belém; the Fundação Gilberto Freyre in Recife; the Fundação Casa de Jorge Amado in Salvador; the Museu Paulista in São Paulo (especially Ernandes Evaristo Lopes); and the Arquivo Nacional, Biblioteca Nacional (especially Elizete Higino), Museu de Belas Artes (especially Andrea Pedreira), Museu da Imagem e do Som, and Fundação Darcy Ribeiro, all in Rio de Janeiro, for their help in finding, copying, and securing permissions for various documents and images. I am indebted to Filipe Bastos, Jean Galvão, and Maurício de Sousa for the opportunity to reproduce their artwork in the book and to Wolf Lustig for allowing me to cite his research with nineteenth-century Guarani materials from Paraguay.

To colleagues, friends, and family in Brazil who shared work or ideas, helped with materials and references, and otherwise made life better, my profound thanks: Ditte Amskov, Silvina Bustos Argañaraz, Fernando de la Cuadra, Rafael Ehlers, Pierina Germán, Derval Gramacho, Leila Guzmán, Myriam Guzmán, Christophe Kirsch, Robin Lytle, Beth Machado, Ana Amélia Melo, Hélène Menu, Pedro Paulo Vítor da Silva, and Zé Luiz Viera Lacerda.

As the reader will surmise from my title, these histories are mostly from and about Brazil. The ideas and experiences that inform them, however, are from and about many other places as well. Although much of my work in those places has become part of a separate, ongoing project, I wish to thank those who have helped me to understand the relationship between indigeneity, politics, and national belonging in comparative terms, and to figure out, I hope, some of the issues and processes that are specific to Brazil and how they relate to similar issues and processes elsewhere. In Lima, am indebted to the staff and scholars at the Instituto de Estudios Peruanos (IEP) for material and personal support, and especially to Vicky García—a friend as well as an amazingly resourceful library director—who

Acknowledgments / xiii
has helped me secure research materials for over a decade. The late Carlos Iván Degregori invited me to participate in a Rockefeller Foundation research seminar on indigenous peoples and globalization while he was director of the IEP, and I was extremely fortunate then to receive his valuable critique of my incipient project. At the IEP and the Pontificia Universidad Católica, Patty Ames, Manuel Marzal, Patricia Oliart, Gonzalo Portocarrero, and Francisco Verdera offered many helpful suggestions. Juan Carlos Godenzzi and Modesto Galvez Ríos of the Ministry of Education met with me on more than one occasion to discuss the benefits and challenges of managing interculturality. I wish to thank Pedro Godoy at the Biblioteca Benvenutto and the staff of the educational sector at the Biblioteca Nacional, the Centro de Estudios Andinos Bartolomé de las Casas, and the Archivo Regional del Cusco, for their help in locating and copying materials. Also in Cusco, Gina Maldonado shared her knowledge of Quechua language, history, and culture. For invaluable ideas and experiences in Apurímac, Ayacucho, Cajamarca, Cusco, Iquitos, Lambayeque, Lima, and Puno, I wish to acknowledge Braulio Allcca Sánchez, Félix Allcca González, Reina Altamirano Sánchez, Jaime Antezano, Francisco Boluarte Garay, Enrique Bossio, Alejandrina Carrión, Luz María Carrión, Milton Cordova La Torre, Nelva de la Cruz, Edwin Fernández Mañuico, María Vidalina García Zea, Rolando Hinostroza, Margarita Huayhua, Jorge Loayza Camargo, Tarcila Rivera Zea, Rafael Tapia, Jorge Vallejo Villavicencio, and Madeleine Zúñiga. I am grateful to Diana Balcázar, Miguel Calderón, Lali Cruz, Máximo Gallo, Claudia García, Jessica Soto, and María Amelia Trigoso for their support and companionship on cloudy days. Colossal thanks to Eliana Villar, comrade and confidante extraordinaire in Durham and Lima for seventeen years.

In Guatemala, I would like to thank the colleagues and collaborators in Chichicastenango, Guatemala City, Quetzaltenango, and Todos Santos Cuchumatán who spoke with me in their offices, homes, and churches about the ideas in this book. Demetrio Cojtí Cuxil and the facilitators of the Proyecto de Educación Maya Bilingüe Intercultural were especially kind to share some of their work. In Bolivia, Guadalupe Reque de Quinteros, Ronald Reque Valverde, Daniela Quinteros Reque, Lizeth Quinteros Reque, and Rene Saenz Reque treated me like family and opened up places and processes in a rapidly changing political context that otherwise would have been inaccessible to me.

My earliest dealings with these questions came about during my tenure as a graduate student in government at the College of William and Mary, and for their benevolent guidance during those years, I thank T. J. Cheng,
David Dessler, and Michael T. Clark, who led me into briar patches of precapitalist modes of production, Sandinista-Miskito relations, and related matters that have informed my thinking ever since. Maryse Fauvel, Teresa Longo, and Ann Marie Stock were magnificent advisors who helped me begin to build a theoretical bridge between political science and cultural studies. Ann Marie served as an outside reader of my thesis and offered, among other things, precious writing advice that has served me well over the years. When the road ahead was uncertain and steep, Maryse encouraged me to pursue my education, and for her inspiration, I am ever appreciative.

For their guidance and support during my doctoral studies at Duke University, I would like to express my immense gratitude to my wonderful teachers and mentors, especially Alberto Moreiras, my dissertation director, and John French, Walter Mignolo, and Leslie Damasceno, my dissertation advisors. Although that project did not become this book, many of the ideas herein percolated out of that work to preoccupy me for years to come. John has been a particularly spirited interlocutor since the day I first showed up to one of his classes. His encouragement and enthusiasm, shared from Brazil and the United States, have been crucial to this and many of my intellectual endeavors. Also while at Duke, I had the great fortune to study with Marisol de la Cadena, then at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. As evidenced by these pages, Marisol’s work has been central to my thinking about indigenous history, politics, and cultural production, and I cannot thank her enough for her support and friendship over the years. From sharing archival materials and commenting on proposals, to putting me in touch with intriguing people and stories, to, not least, caring about my development as a scholar, she has enriched my work and life for nearly two decades.

A community of dear graduate school friends (some enrolled, others not) has long sustained me with shared ideas, writing, travel, living space, good times, and some anguish on three continents. Wholehearted thanks to Sergio Alonso, Jon Beasley-Murray, Marc Brudzinski, José Luis Fernández, Pablo Filippo, Alessandro Fornazzari, Juanjo Frei, Jan Hoffman French, Adriana Johnson, Horacio Legrás, Ryan Long, Jorge Marturano, Anjali Prabhu, Freya Schiwy, Analisa Taylor, and Caroline Yezer. Idelber Avelar has been a model of intellectual political engagement since I first met him, back in the day, and I have been fortunate to count on his friendship and support, especially in recent years.

In Miami, I have been blessed with extraordinary friends who have seen me through the final and most trying stages of this work. George
Yúdice read the entire manuscript and offered comments, counsel, and steady encouragement throughout the process. I could not be more grateful to him for his generous support and for never failing to ask how things were going, even when he was nearly overwhelmed with his own massive amounts of work. Bianca Premo and Kate Ramsey, treasured friends as well as writing group partners, read and commented on several versions of several chapters, always posing helpful questions and offering insight and strong shoulders to make the whole process more fruitful and less lonesome. Hugo Achugar, with whom I had the joy of working for several years, has been a steadfast mentor and advocate, even when (and perhaps most especially) he has disagreed with me. A good friend and staunch ally, Bill Smith shared fabulous resources and much needed advice over the years—including helpful comments on portions of the manuscript. To Steve Butterman, my partner in Brazilian studies at the University of Miami (UM), who could not possibly have been more supportive or understanding, love and infinite gratitude. For their comments on one or more chapters at different stages of the writing process, I also wish to thank the UM Atlantic Studies Working Group (especially Eduardo Elena, Mary Lindemann, Michael Miller, Kyle Siebrecht, and Ashli White) and my dear and generous friend Tim Watson for facilitating that meeting; as well as my colleagues, Anne Cruz, Viviana Díaz-Balsera, David Ellison, Elena Grau-Llevería, and Ralph Heyndels. For her help with the intricacies of nineteenth-century Italian prose, my thanks go to Maria Galli Stampino.

For offering friendship, solidarity, and/or constructive critique from near and far, I would like to express my warm appreciation to Chrissy Arce, Ariel Armony, Molly Benson Prince, Rebecca Biron, Merike Blofield, Anabel Buchenau, Jürgen Buchenau, Otávio Bueno, Luis Cárcamo-Huechante, Christina Civantos, Jane Connolly, Colleen Culleton, Emilio del Valle Escalante, Evelina Galang, Laura Giannetti, Richard Gordon, Pam Hammons, Annette Jones, Barry Levitt, Andrew Lynch, Lillian Manzor, Jody McCourt, Martha Miller, Leah O’Leary, Gema Pérez-Sánchez, Jill Stark Koeppen, Rodney Roberts, Gustavo Rodriguez, Steve Stein, Michelle Warren, Subha Xavier, and Paul Youngman. Heartfelt thanks to Kunal Parker, whose wisdom, kindness, and humor made the last year I spent working on this book better in numberless forms.

I have had the good fortune at UM to work with a superb library staff and fantastic administrative colleagues and have counted on Elizabeth Desarov, Lilly Leyva, Matt Lubbock, Keyla Medina, and Michelle Prats for years of invaluable assistance. Many remarkable undergraduate and graduate students have helped me to think through some of the questions
raised here, whether in class or in their own projects. I would like to acknowledge especially Eduardo Castro, Monique Labat, Américo Mendoza-Mori, Alfredo Palacio, María Gracía Pardo, Maisa Zakir, and two excellent research assistants: Sandra Bernal Heredia and Katherine Davis. You have taught me much, and I look forward to reading your books in years to come.

The staff at the University of North Carolina Press has been wonderfully supportive of this project for nearly two years. I would like to thank my editor, Mark Simpson-Vos, and his assistant, Zachary Read, for their patience and careful guidance; Alex Martin for his helpful suggestions and exceptional copyediting; Paula Wald for shepherding the manuscript through production; and Dino Battista and Beth Lassiter for their work in promoting the book.

Andrew Canessa, whose work I have long admired, kindly expressed interest in this project when I first contacted him regarding the First Peoples Initiative several years ago, and to him I am also sincerely grateful. The anonymous readers of my manuscript provided invaluable critique and advice, and I thank them for considering my work with such care and in the genuine spirit of helping me to make it a better book. While any value this project might now have is largely due to them and to all of the mentors, colleagues, and friends mentioned above, its shortcomings, of course, belong to me.

I wish, finally, to thank my family for their encouragement and patience. To my remarkable grandmother, Concetta, who, approaching her centenary, has seen it all, already, and charitably reminds me not to worry; to my godmother, Joanne, always a strong and precious ally; to my brother Matthew, who shares my incapacity to ignore the other side of the story; to my brother Patrick, who won back his life while I fiddled around with these pages and taught me more about courage than I ever cared to learn; and to my parents, Thomas and Jeanne, whom I could not love more, and who never wavered in their support, despite the fact that we disagree about many important things: my deepest gratitude. Words are insufficient to thank Eduardo, who accompanied this project with extraordinary generosity for over a decade, contributed to it in immeasurable ways, and gave me, during the same years, two most precious gifts: Marina and Siena, brilliant and challenging teachers who, as fortune would have it, graciously invite me to play on the seashores of their endless worlds.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AIR</td>
<td>Acampamento Revolucionário Indígena (<em>sic</em>) (Indigenous Revolutionary Camp)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNPI</td>
<td>Conselho Nacional pela Proteção dos Índios (National Council for the Protection of Indians)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COIAB</td>
<td>Coordenação das Organizações Indígenas da Amazônia Brasileira (Coordination of Indigenous Organizations of the Brazilian Amazon)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPI</td>
<td>Comissão Parlamentar de Inquérito (Parliamentary Commission of Inquiry)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EBI</td>
<td>Educação Bilíngue Intercultural (Bilingual Intercultural Education)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FBC</td>
<td>Fundação Brasil Central (Central Brazil Foundation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FINRAF</td>
<td>Former International Reserve of Amazon Forest (<em>sic</em>)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FUNAI</td>
<td>Fundação Nacional do Índio (National Indian Foundation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GRUMIN</td>
<td>Grupo de Mulheres Indígenas (Group of Indigenous Women)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IIHA</td>
<td>Instituto Internacional da Hiléia Amazônica (International Hylean Amazon Institute)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INBRAPI</td>
<td>Instituto Indígena Brasileiro para Propriedade Intelectual (Brazilian Indigenous Institute for Intellectual Property)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>nongovernmental organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAC</td>
<td>Programa de Aceleração do Crescimento (Accelerated Growth Program)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PT</td>
<td>Partido dos Trabalhadores (Workers’ Party)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIVAM</td>
<td>Sistema de Vigilância da Amazônia (Amazonian Vigilance System)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPI</td>
<td>Serviço de Proteção aos Índios (Indian Protection Service)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNI</td>
<td>União das Nações Indígenas (Union of Indigenous Nations)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VNA</td>
<td>Vídeo nas Aldeias (Video in the Villages)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>